

**Complementarity and Coordination of Conflict Resolution Efforts
in the Conflicts over Abkhazia, South Ossetia, and Transdniestria**

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy at George Mason University

By
Susan Allen Nan
M.S., Conflict Analysis and Resolution
George Mason University, 1995
B.A., Political and Social Thought
University of Virginia, 1992

Dissertation Committee:
Christopher Mitchell, Ph.D., Director
Daniel Druckman, Ph.D.
Mark Katz, Ph.D.

Fall Semester 1999
Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution
George Mason University
Fairfax, Virginia

UMI Number: 9948035

Copyright 1999 by
Nan, Susan Allen

All rights reserved.

UMI[®]

UMI Microform 9948035

Copyright 2000 by Bell & Howell Information and Learning Company.

All rights reserved. This microform edition is protected against
unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.

Bell & Howell Information and Learning Company
300 North Zeeb Road
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT.....	XIII
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 QUESTIONS GUIDING THE RESEARCH.....	5
1.2 OVERVIEW.....	8
2 RESEARCH CONTEXT: RESEARCH ON THE INTERACTIONS OF MULTIPLE CONFLICT RESOLUTION EFFORTS.....	11
2.1 CONTINGENCY APPROACHES TO CONFLICT ANALYSIS AND RESOLUTION.....	12
2.2 TYPOLOGIES OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES.....	22
2.3 SEQUENCING, STAGES AND TIMING.....	31
2.4 COORDINATION OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES.....	34
2.5 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK.....	35
3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY.....	38
3.1 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	38
3.2 FOCUSED COMPARATIVE CASE STUDY RESEARCH DESIGN RATIONALE.....	42
3.3 KEY VARIABLES.....	45
3.3.1 TABLE: COMPARING CONFLICT NATURE ACROSS CASES.....	47
3.4 CASE SELECTION.....	49
3.5 RESEARCH FRAMEWORK.....	51
3.5.1 FIGURE: RESEARCH FRAMEWORK.....	52
3.6 DATA COLLECTION.....	52
3.6.1 TABLE: DATA COLLECTION METHODS.....	54
3.6.2 DOCUMENTARY DATA.....	55
3.6.3 INTERVIEWS.....	55
3.6.4 TABLE: SUMMARY OF MAIN INTERVIEWEE TYPES.....	60
3.6.5 TABLE: SUMMARY OF INTERVIEWEE SUB-TYPES.....	62
3.6.6 PARTICIPANT-OBSERVATION.....	66
3.7 DATA ANALYSIS.....	67
3.7.1 ANALYSIS OF EACH CASE.....	68
3.7.2 TABLE: RESEARCH STEPS FOR CASE ANALYSIS.....	69
3.7.3 COMPARISON ACROSS CASES.....	71
3.7.4 TABLE: RESEARCH STEPS FOR COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CASES.....	71

3.8	CONFLICT CHRONOLOGIES.....	72
3.8.1	TABLE: SCALE OF WAR AND POST-WAR TENSION LEVELS	77
3.9	STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS.....	78
3.10	CONCLUSION	80
4	<u>CASE STUDY: CONFLICT RESOLUTION IN THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA....</u>	<u>82</u>
4.1	SYNOPSIS OF THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA	82
4.2	CHRONOLOGICAL SUMMARY	89
4.2.1	TABLE: ABKHAZIA: CHRONOLOGY OF CONFLICT DEVELOPMENTS	90
4.2.2	TABLE: ABKHAZIA: CHRONOLOGY OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION EFFORTS	92
4.2.3	TABLE: ABKHAZIA: CHRONOLOGY OF TENSION LEVELS.....	96
4.3	CONFLICT RESOLUTION INTERVENORS IN THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA	99
4.3.1	TABLE: INTERVENORS AND INTERVENTIONS IN THE ABKHAZ PEACE PROCESS.....	100
4.4	CONFLICT RESOLUTION EFFORTS IN THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA.....	104
4.4.1	NEGOTIATING OFFICIAL AGREEMENTS.....	107
4.4.2	BUILDING CONFIDENCE THROUGH OFFICIAL MEDIATORS.....	110
4.4.3	APPLYING ACADEMIC EXPERTISE	110
4.4.4	BUILDING LOCAL CAPACITIES FOR PEACE.....	114
4.4.5	CONFIDENCE BUILDING.....	115
4.4.6	STRENGTHENING CROSS-CONFLICT LINKAGES THROUGH NGO SPECIAL INTERESTS	120
4.4.7	BUILDING REGIONAL IDENTITY AND ADDRESSING REGIONAL ISSUES.....	123
4.4.8	HUMANITARIAN ASSISTANCE.....	124
4.4.9	PSYCHO-SOCIAL REHABILITATION	126
4.4.10	DEMOCRACY BUILDING.....	129
4.5	INTERACTIONS OF MULTIPLE INTERVENTIONS.....	129
4.5.1	INTERACTIVE EFFECTS WITHIN TRACK ONE EFFORTS	134
4.5.2	SHORT TERM INTERACTIVE EFFECT OF TRACK TWO INTERVENTIONS	135
4.5.3	LONG-TERM INTERACTIVE EFFECTS OF TRACK TWO INTERVENTIONS	137
4.6	SYNTHESIS OF COMPLEMENTARITY FINDINGS	142
4.6.1	PIECES OF THE PEACE PROCESS.....	143
4.6.2	OFFICIAL AND UNOFFICIAL INITIATIVES.....	144
4.6.3	TIMING	146
4.6.4	CROSS-CONFLICT INTERACTIONS	147
4.6.5	ONGOING PROJECTS	148
4.6.6	TOO MANY INTERVENORS	149
4.7	MULTIPLICITY OF INTERVENTIONS IN THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA.....	150
4.8	COORDINATION OF MULTIPLE INTERVENTIONS IN THE CONFLICT OVER ABKHAZIA....	154
4.8.1	THE CHALLENGES OF COORDINATING.....	154
4.8.2	CHALLENGES FOR LOCALS COORDINATING	158
4.8.3	EFFECTIVE COORDINATING EFFORTS	160
4.8.4	INTERNATIONAL EFFECTIVE COORDINATING EFFORTS	161
4.8.5	LOCAL EFFECTIVE COORDINATING EFFORTS.....	165
4.8.6	IMPROVING COORDINATION	167
4.9	CASE STUDY SUMMARY	168

5.8	CASE STUDY SUMMARY	227
5.9	CONCLUSION	232
6 CASE STUDY: CONFLICT RESOLUTION IN THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA.....		233
6.1	OVERVIEW OF THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA	233
6.2	CONFLICT AND CONFLICT RESOLUTION CHRONOLOGIES	238
6.2.1	TABLE: TRANSDNIESTRIA: CHRONOLOGY OF CONFLICT DEVELOPMENTS	239
6.2.2	TABLE: TRANSDNIESTRIA: CHRONOLOGY OF CONFLICT RESOLUTION EFFORTS.....	241
6.2.3	TABLE: TRANSDNIESTRIA: CHRONOLOGY OF TENSION LEVELS	245
6.3	CONFLICT RESOLUTION INTERVENORS IN THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA	247
6.3.1	TABLE: CONFLICT RESOLUTION ACTORS AND ACTIVITIES IN THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA	248
6.4	CONFLICT RESOLUTION EFFORTS IN THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA.....	251
6.4.1	NEGOTIATING OFFICIAL AGREEMENTS.....	252
6.4.2	BUILDING CONFIDENCE THROUGH OFFICIAL MEDIATORS	253
6.4.3	APPLYING ACADEMIC EXPERTISE	254
6.4.4	BUILDING LOCAL CAPACITIES FOR PEACE – ADDRESSING LOCAL NEEDS	254
6.4.5	CONFIDENCE BUILDING.....	256
6.4.6	STRENGTHENING CROSS-CONFLICT LINKAGES THROUGH NGO SPECIAL INTERESTS	257
6.4.7	BUILDING REGIONAL IDENTITY AND ADDRESSING REGIONAL ISSUES.....	259
6.4.8	HUMANITARIAN ASSISTANCE — DEVELOPMENT	259
6.4.9	DEMOCRACY BUILDING—BUILDING CIVIL SOCIETY	260
6.4.10	LONG-TERM UNOFFICIAL FACILITATED JOINT ANALYSIS AMONGST NEGOTIATORS (LUFJAAN).....	261
6.5	INTERACTIONS OF MULTIPLE INTERVENTIONS.....	268
6.6	SYNTHESIS OF COMPLEMENTARITY FINDINGS	272
6.7	COORDINATION OF MULTIPLE INTERVENTIONS	274
6.8	CASE STUDY SUMMARY	281
6.9	CONCLUSION	285
7 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CASE STUDIES.....		287
7.1	INTRODUCTION	287
7.2	COMPARING CONFLICT NATURES.....	288
7.2.1	TABLE: COMPARING CONFLICT NATURE ACROSS CASES	289
7.3	COMPARING CONFLICT TENSION LEVELS.....	290
7.3.1	TABLE: COMPARING CONFLICT TENSION LEVELS	292
7.4	COMPARING INTERVENORS	293
7.4.1	TABLE: COMPARING INTERVENORS.....	294
7.5	COMPARING INTERVENTIONS.....	294
7.5.1	TABLE: COMPARING CONFLICT RESOLUTION INTERVENTIONS ACROSS CASES	295
7.6	COMPARING COMPLEMENTARITY: DIFFERENCES	297
7.7	COMPARING COMPLEMENTARITY: GENERALIZATIONS	300

7.7.1	COMPLEMENTARITY OF INTERVENOR ROLES	302
7.7.2	COMPLEMENTARITY OVER TIME	303
7.7.3	COMPLEMENTARITY ACROSS APPROACHES	304
7.8	COMPARING COORDINATION.....	308
7.8.1	TYPES OF COORDINATION	310
7.8.2	CHALLENGES TO COORDINATION.....	311
7.8.3	EFFECTIVE COORDINATION.....	313
7.8.4	IMPROVING COORDINATION.....	313
7.9	OVERALL FOCUSED COMPARISON	315
7.9.1	TOO MANY INTERVENORS.....	320
7.9.2	LONG-TERM UNOFFICIAL FACILITATED JOINT ANALYSIS AMONGST NEGOTIATORS (LUFJAAN).....	321
7.9.3	RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN FACTORS.....	322
7.9.4	FIGURE: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN MAIN FACTORS	324
7.9.5	FIGURE: RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN FACTORS UNIQUE TO THE ABKHAZ CASE STUDY...	325
7.10	ALTERNATIVE EXPLANATIONS	326
7.11	CONCLUSION	328
8	IMPLICATIONS FOR THEORY, PRACTICE, AND RESEARCH	329
8.1	IMPLICATIONS FOR COMPLEMENTARITY THEORY.....	330
8.1.1	COMPLEMENTARITY OF SEPARATE INITIATIVES AFFECTS OVERALL PEACE PROCESSES.	331
8.1.2	GRASSROOTS LEVEL CONFLICT RESOLUTION APPROACHES CONTRIBUTE TO SUBJECTIVE, OBJECTIVE, AND PROCEDURAL ASPECT OF PEACE PROCESSES.....	331
8.1.3	LONG-TERM UNOFFICIAL FACILITATED JOINT ANALYSIS AMONGST NEGOTIATIONS (LUFJAAN) IS HIGHLY COMPLEMENTARY TO OFFICIAL NEGOTIATIONS.	332
8.1.4	INTERVENOR OVERLOAD LEADS TO NEGATIVE INTERACTIVE EFFECTS.	333
8.1.5	CUMULATIVE EFFECTS OVER TIME CAN BE COMPLEMENTARY.....	334
8.2	IMPLICATIONS FOR COORDINATION THEORY	334
8.2.1	THEORETICAL CONTRIBUTION: TYPES OF COORDINATION	335
8.2.2	THEORETICAL CONTRIBUTION: CHALLENGES TO COORDINATION.....	336
8.2.3	THEORETICAL CONTRIBUTION: ELEMENTS OF EFFECTIVE COORDINATION.....	337
8.3	IMPLICATIONS FOR COMPLEMENTARITY IN PRACTICE	337
8.3.1	CONSIDER COMPLEMENTARITY WHEN PLANNING INTERVENTIONS.....	339
8.3.2	ENCOURAGE GRASSROOTS LEVEL CONFLICT RESOLUTION APPROACHES IN ADDITION TO HIGH LEVEL WORK.	339
8.3.3	ENCOURAGE THE FACILITATION OF LONG-TERM UNOFFICIAL FACILITATED JOINT ANALYSIS AMONGST NEGOTIATORS (LUFJAAN) AS PART OF THE OVERALL PEACE PROCESS.	340
8.3.4	AVOID INTERVENOR OVERLOAD.....	340
8.3.5	ENCOURAGE POSITIVE CUMULATIVE EFFECTS OVER TIME.	341
8.4	IMPLICATIONS FOR COORDINATION IN PRACTICE.....	342
8.4.1	ENGAGE IN EACH TYPE OF COORDINATION.....	342
8.4.2	GUARD AGAINST CHALLENGES TO COORDINATION AND WORK TO BUILD THE ELEMENTS OF EFFECTIVE COORDINATION.	343
8.4.3	INSTITUTIONALIZE COORDINATION.....	344
8.5	IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH IN COMPLEMENTARITY	345

8.6	IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH IN COORDINATION	347
8.7	GENERAL IMPLICATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.....	348
8.8	CONCLUSION	350
8.8.1	FIGURE: GUIDELINES FOR EFFECTIVE CONFLICT RESOLUTION PRACTICE.....	351
<u>9. APPENDICES.....</u>		<u>354</u>
9.1	MAP OF AREAS OF THE CONFLICTS OVER ABKHAZIA AND SOUTH OSSETIA	355
9.2	MAP OF AREAS OF THE CONFLICT OVER TRANSDNIESTRIA.....	356
9.3	INTERVIEW PROTOCOL	357
9.4	INTERVIEW INFORMATION SHEET.....	359
9.5	LIST OF INTERVIEWS	361
9.6	REFERENCES	365
9.7	ABOUT THE AUTHOR	372